**Methods disclaimer** | This evidence scan was completed to support Kaiser Permanente Washington decisionmakers at a particular point in time. It is not being maintained or updated. Findings may not be generalizable to other settings and contexts.



# Evidence Scan Reducing Missed Visits

## Questions

(1) What patient and visit characteristics are associated with missing scheduled appointments?

(2) What are evidence-based methods for intervening with patients who don't show up for appointments?

### Answer

Evidence indicates that patients with a prior missed-visit history, a long lead time since the scheduling of their appointment, young adults, and those with Medicaid coverage are at higher risk for missed appointments. Evidence-based strategies for reducing rates of missed visits include phone calls from clinic staff, automated phone reminders, and text message reminders. There is limited evidence showing benefits to scheduling-related strategies, and insufficient evidence on other types of interventions.

## Supporting evidence

Based on one systematic review and 8 primary studies, we found consistent patient and visit characteristics associated with missed health care appointments. We found 10 systematic reviews examining the effectiveness of various interventions for reducing no-show rates. These reviews primarily examined various types of reminder systems and scheduling-related strategies, providing little evidence on other types of interventions. Therefore, we supplemented these reviews with eight primary studies that examined the impact of other types of interventions, such as transportation assistance.

#### Characteristics associated with no-shows

We found consistent evidence that the strongest predictors of missed appointments are **prior history of missed visits** and a **long lead time** (i.e., a long length of time between the initial scheduling of the appointment and the actual appointment date). Two studies conducted in Kaiser Permanente Colorado clinics found that having  $\geq 1$  missed appointment in the prior 6 months and having a lead time of >30 days (Steiner 2016) or  $\geq 61$  days (Steiner 2018) were strongly associated with missed appointments.

We also found consistent evidence that **younger age** (e.g., adults age 18-39) and **having Medicaid coverage** were associated with a higher risk of missed appointments.

#### Reminder strategies to reduce no-shows

We found consistent evidence that any type of reminder system results in significantly lower no-show rates compared with no reminders. While effectiveness is similar across reminder systems, **phone reminders from clinic staff** are slightly more effective than **automated phone reminders** for reducing missed visits, and both types of phone reminders are slightly



1

Evidence Scan Date: 9/27/2018 Contact: <u>act-center@kp.org</u>



more effective than **text message reminders**, though text message reminders are generally less costly.

We found limited evidence that two or more reminders are more effective than a single reminder, and that the timing of reminders (1-7 days prior to appointment) does not have a significant effect on missed-visit rates. In addition, we found limited evidence that using predictive modeling to make targeted phone calls to patients identified as at "high-risk" for no-shows is more effective than non-targeted, automated reminders.

#### Scheduling strategies to reduce no-shows

We found limited evidence that open-access or advanced-access scheduling systems are more effective than traditional scheduling systems for reducing missed visits. We also found limited evidence that web-based appointment scheduling systems are more effective than phone-based scheduling systems for reducing missed visits. Finally, we found limited evidence for the effectiveness of a "recall reminder" system (i.e., having the clinic call patients to ask them to schedule their next appointment) compared with "365 scheduling" (i.e., asking patients to schedule their next appointment when they are leaving their current appointment).

#### Other strategies to reduce no-shows

We found insufficient evidence about the effectiveness of other types of interventions, such as transportation assistance.

# **Additional considerations**

- Scheduling multiple appointments on the same day decreased the likelihood of missing an appointment in one study (Goffman 2017).
- Offering transportation assistance through a complimentary ride-sharing service did not affect missed-visit rates in one study (Chaiyachati, 2018).
- Effective reminder systems include those that provide patients with an easy way to immediately cancel or reschedule unwanted appointments (e.g., via SMS response to a text message reminder) (McLean 2014, 2016; Peterson 2015).
- KP Colorado uses a combination appointment reminder system (called IVR-T) that automatically delivers interactive voice response (IVR) reminder calls to landlines and text message reminders to mobile phones (Steiner 2016, 2018).
- For appointments with a high risk of being missed, computer simulations suggest that the use of dynamic scheduling to proactively overbook could lead to an increase in clinic utilization and a decrease in patient wait times with a low risk of appointment conflicts (Creps 2017, Goffman 2017).

# References

1. Ansell D, Crispo JAG, Simard B, et al. Interventions to reduce wait times for primary care appointments: a systematic review. BMC health services research. 2017;17(1):295. PMID: 28427444.



2

Evidence Scan Date: 9/27/2018 Contact: <u>act-center@kp.org</u>



- Chaiyachati KH, Hubbard RA, Yeager A, et al. Association of Rideshare-Based Transportation Services and Missed Primary Care Appointments: A Clinical Trial. JAMA Intern Med. 2018;178(3):383-9. PMID: 29404572.
- 3. Creps J, Lotfi V. A dynamic approach for outpatient scheduling. J Med Econ. 2017;20(8):786-98. PMID: 28402208.
- Cruz HE, Gawrys J, Thompson D, et al. A Multipronged Initiative to Improve Productivity and Patient Access in a Federally Qualified Health Center Network. The Journal of ambulatory care management. 2018;41(3):225-37. PMID: 29847409.
- 5. Dantas LF, Fleck JL, Cyrino Oliveira FL, et al. No-shows in appointment scheduling a systematic literature review. Health policy (Amsterdam, Netherlands). 2018;122(4):412-21. PMID: 29482948.
- 6. Davies ML, Goffman RM, May JH, et al. Large-Scale No-Show Patterns and Distributions for Clinic Operational Research. Healthcare (Basel, Switzerland). 2016;4(1). PMID: 27417603.
- 7. Fischer HH, Moore SL, Johnson TL, et al. Appointment reminders by text message in a safety net health care system: a pragmatic investigation. EGEMS (Washington, DC). 2017;5(1):20. PMID: 29881740.
- 8. George A, Rubin G. Non-attendance in general practice: a systematic review and its implications for access to primary health care. Family practice. 2003;20(2):178-84. PMID: 12651793.
- 9. Goffman RM, Harris SL, May JH, et al. Modeling Patient No-Show History and Predicting Future Outpatient Appointment Behavior in the Veterans Health Administration. Military medicine. 2017;182(5):e1708-e14. PMID: 29087915.
- 10. Gurol-Urganci I, de Jongh T, Vodopivec-Jamsek V, et al. Mobile phone messaging reminders for attendance at healthcare appointments. Cochrane Database Syst Rev. 2013(12):Cd007458. PMID: 24310741.
- Guy R, Hocking J, Wand H, et al. How effective are short message service reminders at increasing clinic attendance? A meta-analysis and systematic review. Health services research. 2012;47(2):614-32. PMID: 22091980.
- 12. Huang Y, Hanauer DA. Patient no-show predictive model development using multiple data sources for an effective overbooking approach. Applied clinical informatics. 2014;5(3):836-60. PMID: 25298821.
- Hwang AS, Atlas SJ, Cronin P, et al. Appointment "no-shows" are an independent predictor of subsequent quality of care and resource utilization outcomes. Journal of general internal medicine. 2015;30(10):1426-33. PMID: 25776581.
- 14. Kaplan-Lewis E, Percac-Lima S. No-show to primary care appointments: why patients do not come. Journal of primary care & community health. 2013;4(4):251-5. PMID: 24327664.
- 15. Markwell T, Amunategui M. Predicting and Preventing Clinic No-Shows. Providence Health & Services [2018 September 20]. https://laurelhurstmanagement.files.wordpress.com/2014/09/287-predicting-and-preventing-clinic-no-shows.pdf.
- 16. McLean S, Gee M, Booth A, et al. Health Services and Delivery Research. Targeting the Use of Reminders and Notifications for Uptake by Populations (TURNUP): a systematic review and evidence synthesis. Southampton (UK): NIHR Journals Library, National Institute for Health Research, Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre; 2014.



3

Evidence Scan Date: 9/27/2018 Contact: <u>act-center@kp.org</u>

A <u>published study</u> related to this evidence scan looks specifically at reducing missed visits through targeted text messages.



- 17. McLean SM, Booth A, Gee M, et al. Appointment reminder systems are effective but not optimal: results of a systematic review and evidence synthesis employing realist principles. Patient preference and adherence. 2016;10:479-99. PMID: 27110102.
- Nuti L, Turkcan A, Lawley MA, et al. The impact of interventions on appointment and clinical outcomes for individuals with diabetes: a systematic review. BMC health services research. 2015;15:355. PMID: 26330299.
- 19. Parikh A, Gupta K, Wilson AC, et al. The effectiveness of outpatient appointment reminder systems in reducing no-show rates. The American journal of medicine. 2010;123(6):542-8. PMID: 20569761.
- 20. Peterson K, McCleery E, Anderson J, et al. Evidence Brief: Comparative Effectiveness of Appointment Recall Reminder Procedures for Follow-up Appointments. VA Evidence-based Synthesis Program Evidence Briefs. Washington (DC)2015.
- 21. Posadzki P, Mastellos N, Ryan R, et al. Automated telephone communication systems for preventive healthcare and management of long-term conditions. Cochrane Database Syst Rev. 2016;12:Cd009921. PMID: 27960229.
- 22. Robotham D, Satkunanathan S, Reynolds J, et al. Using digital notifications to improve attendance in clinic: systematic review and meta-analysis. BMJ open. 2016;6(10):e012116. PMID: 27798006.
- 23. Rose KD, Ross JS, Horwitz LI. Advanced access scheduling outcomes: a systematic review. Arch Intern Med. 2011;171(13):1150-9. PMID: 21518935.
- 24. Samuels RC, Ward VL, Melvin P, et al. Missed Appointments: Factors Contributing to High No-Show Rates in an Urban Pediatrics Primary Care Clinic. Clinical pediatrics. 2015;54(10):976-82. PMID: 25676833.
- 25. Shah SJ, Cronin P, Hong CS, et al. Targeted Reminder Phone Calls to Patients at High Risk of No-Show for Primary Care Appointment: A Randomized Trial. Journal of general internal medicine. 2016;31(12):1460-6. PMID: 27503436.
- 26. Shapiro MF. No-Show Patients and the Triple Aim. Journal of general internal medicine. 2015;30(10):1392-3. PMID: 26080749.
- Steiner JF, Shainline MR, Bishop MC, et al. Reducing Missed Primary Care Appointments in a Learning Health System: Two Randomized Trials and Validation of a Predictive Model. Medical care. 2016;54(7):689-96. PMID: 27077277.
- 28. Steiner JF, Shainline MR, Dahlgren JZ, et al. Optimizing number and timing of appointment reminders: a randomized trial. Am J Manag Care. 2018;24(8):377-84. PMID: 30130032.
- 29. Stubbs ND, Geraci SA, Stephenson PL, et al. Methods to reduce outpatient non-attendance. The American journal of the medical sciences. 2012;344(3):211-9. PMID: 22475731.
- 30. Zhao P, Yoo I, Lavoie J, et al. Web-Based Medical Appointment Systems: A Systematic Review. J Med Internet Res. 2017;19(4):e134. PMID: 28446422.



4

A <u>published study</u> related to this evidence scan looks specifically at reducing missed visits through targeted text messages.